

Eastern Illinois University

## The Keep

---

Masters Theses

Student Theses & Publications

---

2018

# Comparing Primary and Intermediate Elementary Trade Books' Historical Representation of George Washington

Maria Anita Penn

*Eastern Illinois University*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://thekeep.eiu.edu/theses>



Part of the [Elementary Education Commons](#), and the [Elementary Education and Teaching Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Penn, Maria Anita, "Comparing Primary and Intermediate Elementary Trade Books' Historical Representation of George Washington" (2018). *Masters Theses*. 4576.

<https://thekeep.eiu.edu/theses/4576>

This Dissertation/Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Theses & Publications at The Keep. It has been accepted for inclusion in Masters Theses by an authorized administrator of The Keep. For more information, please contact [tabruns@eiu.edu](mailto:tabruns@eiu.edu).



## Thesis Maintenance and Reproduction Certificate

FOR: Graduate Candidates Completing Theses in Partial Fulfillment of the Degree  
Graduate Faculty Advisors Directing the Theses

RE: Preservation, Reproduction, and Distribution of Thesis Research

Preserving, reproducing, and distributing thesis research is an important part of Booth Library's responsibility to provide access to scholarship. In order to further this goal, Booth Library makes all graduate theses completed as part of a degree program at Eastern Illinois University available for personal study, research, and other not-for-profit educational purposes. Under 17 U.S.C. § 108, the library may reproduce and distribute a copy without infringing on copyright; however, professional courtesy dictates that permission be requested from the author before doing so.

Your signatures affirm the following:

- The graduate candidate is the author of this thesis.
- The graduate candidate retains the copyright and intellectual property rights associated with the original research, creative activity, and intellectual or artistic content of the thesis.
- The graduate candidate certifies her/his compliance with federal copyright law (Title 17 of the U. S. Code) and her/his right to authorize reproduction and distribution of all copyrighted materials included in this thesis.
- The graduate candidate in consultation with the faculty advisor grants Booth Library the nonexclusive, perpetual right to make copies of the thesis freely and publicly available without restriction, by means of any current or successive technology, including but not limited to photocopying, microfilm, digitization, or internet.
- The graduate candidate acknowledges that by depositing her/his thesis with Booth Library, her/his work is available for viewing by the public and may be borrowed through the library's circulation and interlibrary loan departments, or accessed electronically. The graduate candidate acknowledges this policy by indicating in the following manner:

☐ Yes, I wish to make accessible this thesis for viewing by the public

☒ No, I wish to quarantine the thesis temporarily and have included the ***Thesis Withholding Request Form***

- The graduate candidate waives the confidentiality provisions of the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act (FERPA) (20 U. S. C. § 1232g; 34 CFR Part 99) with respect to the contents of the thesis and with respect to information concerning authorship of the thesis, including name and status as a student at Eastern Illinois University. I have conferred with my graduate faculty advisor. My signature below indicates that I have read and agree with the above statements, and hereby give my permission to allow Booth Library to reproduce and distribute my thesis. My adviser's signature indicates concurrence to

Graduate Candidate Signature

Maria Penn

Printed Name

MS.ed

Graduate Degree Program

Faculty Adviser Signature

John Bickford

Printed Name

1-3-19

Date

*Please submit in duplicate.*

Comparing Primary and Intermediate Elementary Trade Books'

Historical Representation of George Washington

(TITLE)

BY

Maria Anita Penn

**THESIS**

SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS  
FOR THE DEGREE OF

Master of Science in Elementary Education

IN THE GRADUATE SCHOOL, EASTERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY  
CHARLESTON, ILLINOIS

Spring 2018

YEAR

I HEREBY RECOMMEND THAT THIS THESIS BE ACCEPTED AS FULFILLING  
PART OF THE GRADUATE DEGREE CITED ABOVE

4-30-18

DATE

DEPARTMENT/SCHOOL CHAIR  
OR CHAIR'S DESIGNEE

DATE

30 April 2018

THESIS COMMITTEE MEMBER

DATE

THESIS COMMITTEE MEMBER

DATE

4/30/18

THESIS COMMITTEE MEMBER

DATE

THESIS COMMITTEE MEMBER

DATE

Comparing Primary and Intermediate Elementary Trade Books' Historical Representation of  
George Washington

Maria A. Penn

Eastern Illinois University

Copyright © 2018

Maria Anita Penn

All Rights Reserved

### **Abstract**

As teachers learn to adjust to the Common Core State Standards, they are left with little to no time for subjects like science and social studies. History is slowly falling by the wayside in elementary classrooms across the country, including the studies of the people who helped shape our nation. This study analyzes a data sample of 32 primary and intermediate level trade books about George Washington, our first president, in search of patterns and misrepresentations. Within the findings, patterns of omission and spiraling were seen across the board. This study allows teachers to see the importance of teaching history in their classroom and provides them with detailed ideas to help them incorporate history in traditional and traditional ways.

### **Dedication**

This research is dedicated to my children- so that they may know that anything is possible. For Thomas Bullock, thank you for always believing in me and for teaching me the value of education. You helped give me the one gift that can never be taken away, my education. For my husband, for always supporting me and keeping me sane while I spent late nights up doing homework, studying and researching. And last, but not least, to my parents for always believing in me, and for the endless love, support and encouragement throughout all of my life- I love you!

### **Acknowledgments**

A special thank you to my thesis chair, Dr. Bickford- thank you for all of your help and guidance during this long process of researching and writing. I would not have made it through this process as quickly and smoothly as I did without all of your help.

I would also like to give a sincere thank you to my two other thesis committee members, Dr. Kory and Dr. Seiler. Thank you for all of the advice and time you put in to making my research possible.

Lastly, a special acknowledgment to all of my family and friends for believing in me and helping push me to my fullest potential- I couldn't have done this without you!



## Table of Contents

	<b>Page</b>
Introduction .....	8
Literature Review .....	8
State and National Initiatives .....	9
Common Core and ELA .....	9
C3 & Social Studies/History .....	10
Curricular Resources .....	12
Textbooks .....	12
Primary Sources .....	13
Trade Books .....	14
Historical Significance of George Washington .....	15
Methods .....	19
Findings .....	21
(Table 1) Text Structure .....	21
(Table 2) Myths .....	23
(Table 3) Lifestyle .....	24
(Table 4) Representation in War .....	27
(Table 5) Presidency .....	29
(Table 6) Heroism .....	31
Discussion .....	32
Implications for Researchers .....	33
Implications for Teachers .....	34

Limitations .....	37
Areas for Future Study .....	37
References .....	38
Appendices .....	44
Appendix A .....	44
Appendix B .....	47
Appendix C .....	48

### **Introduction**

In school's children learn to read and read to learn. Students read multiple texts, from multiple genres for multiple purposes. Through these texts, teachers should be teaching students to think and read critically from different perspectives, not just to read to comprehend. This topic and historical figure, George Washington, lends itself to teachers as they create a classroom environment where reading critically from different perspectives can thrive. This research analyzes the historical representation of George Washington in primary and intermediate level children's trade books and unearths many of the misconceptions and myths common in public consciousness that revolve a man so well-known in our country.

### **Literature Review**

President George Washington was more than just the first president of the United States of America (U.S.A). He was an active leader and helped the United States of America gain its independence during the American Revolutionary War. One is left to wonder how the complex history of the First President of the United States of America is represented, or perhaps misrepresented. Most states have adopted the Common Core State Standards (Common Core State Standards Initiative, [hereafter CCSS], 2010), which places high importance on the use of nonfiction text beginning in elementary school. In this desperate time of change in the public-school system, educators are faced with a book full of standards, a plethora of resources and the always consistent historical concepts to be taught. This review will analyze the Common Core State Standards and the C3 Framework for Social Studies (National Council for the Social Studies [hereafter NCSS], 2013), to decide what educators should be teaching and focusing on within their classroom. It will discuss the different text-based curricular resources teachers have

access to, and each of their positive and negative attributes and finally it will discuss the historical significance of the one and only President George Washington. Contemporary education initiatives magnify the importance of this inquiry.

### **State and National Initiatives**

The use of the Common Core State Standards and other contemporary education initiatives are expanding rapidly across the United States of America “The Common Core State Standards initiatives will require numerous changes in philosophy, curriculum, instruction, and assessment” (Wallender, 2014, p. 7). These standards have created a common set of guidelines that are designed to prepare students for college readiness, and stress an equal education for all students. The State of Illinois is one of the many states that have adopted the Common Core State Standards (CCSS, 2010). Similar to Common Core, the NCSS C3 Framework has been implemented in social studies classrooms. Like the CCSS, the NCSS C3 Framework aims to create a population of students who are college and career ready by the time they leave high school. “The C3 Framework is centered on an Inquiry Arc – a set of interlocking and mutually supportive ideas that frame the ways students learn social studies content” (NCSS, 2013, p. 6). The overarching goal is to help students effectively learn the concepts from each of the different social studies disciplines of civics, economics, geography, and history. The C3 Framework and social studies pedagogy intentionally align closely with CCSS and English Language Arts (ELA) pedagogy.

**Common Core and ELA.** Common Core strongly encourages ELA teachers to read increasingly complex texts that represent diverse viewpoints while balancing non-fiction, or informational texts, with fiction, or literature. According to Schwebel (2014) the CCSS (2010) strongly suggest the increased use of nonfiction (texts) in curriculum with increasing text

complexity. Common Core also recommends that ELA teachers spend at least half of their time (50%) on nonfiction texts (CCSS, 2010). Using and analyzing texts that encompass divergent viewpoints allows students to look at a text more critically. As a result of the increased text complexity and the variety of text types being used, ELA teachers and Social Studies teachers are needing to explore and apply effective reading and comprehension strategies within their classrooms (Uecker, Kelley, & Napierala, 2014).

ELA teachers, to do so, must incorporate discipline-specific close reading strategies. One of the major aspects of the common core reading and writing standards at all grade levels, is the students ability to summarize. As stated by CCSS (CCSS, 2010), summarization of these nonfiction texts “requires that students recognize main ideas and key details, disregard unimportant or repetitive ideas, construct topic sentences, paraphrase and collapse or combine lists or events into general statements” (Shanahan, 2015, p. 15).

To demonstrate students’ learning, ELA teachers are to utilize age-appropriate text-based writing prompts. Text based writing prompt are an excellent way for students to show what they know and to incorporate literacy into multiple content areas. “The Common Core State Standards make clear that literacy is the shared responsibility of all content area teachers. English teachers can’t do it alone” (Jago, 2014, p. 11). When educators implement text-based writing prompts in their classroom, they are encouraging their students to critically analyze non-fiction texts. Educators who use text-based writing prompts can also gather a deeper understanding of their students’ content knowledge through their reflective writing.

**C3 & Social Studies/History.** The C3 (The College Career and Civic Life) Framework is intended to supplement the Common Core State Standards (CCSS, 2010). Students are positioned to ask and respond to complex questions, consider various sources, utilize disciplinary

literacy to analyze the texts, and demonstrate newly generated understandings in civic-oriented ways. Stated differently, they are to engage in close reading and text-based writing in order ask and answer germane questions. Within the NCSS C3 Framework, it recommends that all topics in social studies have multiple, diverse texts, suggesting that social studies teachers should use more than just their textbooks. Not only should teachers use more than just textbooks, but teachers should be “balancing the reading of literature with the reading of informational texts, including texts in history/social studies...” (CCSS, 2010, p. 5). Supplementation of resources like, primary sources and trade books, are highly advised. It is also strongly recommended within the C3 Framework that teachers use both primary and secondary sources when selecting classroom texts.

Teachers are to incorporate discipline-specific close reading strategies. These close reading strategies will help students to better comprehend the text they are reading and should in a sense, help students become better historical thinkers. When students participate in close reading strategies, they dig deeper and analyze texts on a higher level of critical thinking. The NCSS suggests that “developing historical knowledge in connection with historical investigation not only helps students remember the content better because it has meaning, but also allows students to become better thinkers” (NCSS, 2013, p. 45).

To demonstrate students' learning, Social Studies teachers are to utilize age-appropriate text-based writing prompts. Similar to the CCSS, the NCSS place an emphasis on writing. “Social studies teachers are now expected to teach reading, writing, and inquiry, in addition to covering the long list of details specified in their states' standards and assessments” (Monte-Sano, De La Paz, & Felton, 2015, p. 194). Text-based writing prompts allow for a smooth content area transition between social studies/history and reading/writing because “students’



reading, thinking and writing are interconnected” (Monte-Sano, et al., p. 196). The interconnection between reading, writing and thinking indicates that a student who completes a text-based writing piece is more likely to remember the content being taught.

### **Curricular Resources**

In today's education system, social studies teachers are faced with a plethora of text-based curricular resources to choose from. Text books, primary sources and trade books are all conventional forms of curricular resources being used in social studies classrooms today. Unfortunately, none of these common curricular resources are free of flaws and each possess positive and negative characteristics (Bickford, Dilley, & Metz, 2015). Social studies teachers must be careful when picking text-based resources to use in their classroom, as many include misrepresentations of the people and events depicted in the text, often describing people in power more auspiciously than others (Morgan & Forest, 2016). For this reason, educators must try to select texts free of bias that accurately convey historical events.

**Textbooks.** Textbooks are generally the most popular curricular resource used for teaching social studies (history) in elementary, middle level and high school classes (Bean, Zigmond, & Hartman, 1994). Textbooks are so popular in the social studies classroom because they often follow a specific curriculum, introduce events and historical figures in sequence and provide teachers with a framework to follow when implementing a topic or unit (Moss, 1992). For these reasons, textbooks are often the 'go to' for many educators. Textbooks, however, are often very blandly written, with information that is either inconsistent or written at a level too high for the intended audience. Textbook vocabulary is often too advanced for students making the book “unappealing and boring” (Moss, 1992, p. 26). Textbooks also cover such a wide range of information that the key details of and perhaps the richness about events are left out.

Censorship often appears in textbook publishing. Censorship comes in many forms and covers a wide variety of requirements. Textbook publishing companies often have “lists of words, topics, and phrases writers should not use lest any group be offended” (Matusevich, 2006, p. 361). Textbook publishing companies often censor and set limitations for the images and content perceived as contentious even if it aligns with the most current historical scholarship. Censorship regulations often leads to textbooks becoming dull as they evade consequential historical concepts that may evoke vitriol from various political factions and societal elements.

**Primary sources.** Primary sources are perhaps some of the most representative resources used in social studies classrooms. Primary sources are text-based documents that were written first hand by someone who experienced or lived through the time period at hand. These primary sources have the ability to take the reader back in time and depict first-hand accounts of historical events and people. For these reasons, primary sources make an excellent supplementary resource in a social studies classroom, but should not necessarily be used for primary instruction.

Like all curricular resources, primary sources do possess some negative attributes, when looking at them from an educator's point of view. Primary sources are (most frequently) written for adults by adults, making them harder for students to comprehend. Morris, Morgan-Fleming, and Janisch (2001) stated that “working with primary sources presents certain difficulties. Unfamiliar vocabulary, lack of punctuation, colloquial language, and differences in spelling, handwriting, word meaning, and grammar make it difficult for students to understand primary source” (p. 153). Primary sources are uncommon in the classroom, which makes them more difficult for students to examine. Seeing as primary sources are often written by an individual, the author's biases and presumptions appear. Unless an educator can find and implement a



multitude of primary sources into a lesson or unit, students may be able to read every word but fail to see the significance of and interconnections between these artifacts from the past.

**Trade books.** Trade books are another vital curricular resource that teachers have access to in their classroom. These curricular resources are full of substance, they're engaging, and contain interesting/ new characters. "Trade books are a valuable curricular resource because they can evoke students' interest in history using age-appropriate prose" (Bickford & Schuette, 2016, p. 22). Age appropriateness is a huge positive when considering the different curricular resources at hand. Trade books are written on the same subject, at different reading levels and designed to fit a multitude of age ranges. "Trade books can provide social studies teachers with secondary historical sources written at various reading levels, enabling the selection of works developmentally appropriate for specific students" (Sakowicz, 2016, p. 34). Along with the different levels trade books are written at, trade books are a curricular resource that the teacher can individualize instruction for, by choosing books that best fit the individual students. Unlike the common text book, trade books are also written in a way that is easy to follow and more logically coherent- making it easier for the reader to become engaged (Moss, 1992). Perhaps one of the greatest benefits to using trade books in the classroom, is that they are extremely plentiful. Trade books make an excellent supplemental resource for a multitude of reasons. Not only are trade books inexpensive, but anywhere from dozens to hundreds of trade books exist for almost any given historical topic (Bickford & Silva, 2016). This means that trade books are very easily obtainable for the everyday classroom teacher.

Like all curricular resources, trade books are not without flaws. One flaw to consider when using trade books in the classroom is the amount (or lack thereof) research that exists regarding trade books. Trade books have not been widely studied by researchers, but the

research that does exist shows numerous, substantial historical misrepresentations (Bickford & Schuette, 2016) with no common pattern. These misconceptions and historical misrepresentations are some of the biggest downfalls that affect trade books' use in the classroom. Although these misrepresentations exist in trade books, they should be taken with a grain of salt. Acknowledging that these historical misrepresentations exist, and when being made aware of them, educators have the ability to share them with their students and correct the wrongs within the lesson(s). When considering the commonality of historical misrepresentations in trade books, and the lack of research that currently surrounds them, it opens up a whole new realm for research.

### **Historical Significance of George Washington**

The boy who could not tell a lie, the hero of the American Revolution and the first President of the United States of America. The man, the myth, and the legend, that is George Washington. School children around United States of America grow up hearing his name in school and seeing his face on the one dollar bill, but why is he so important? As one of the founding fathers of our nation, much debate has circled around George Washington. Questions about his childhood, his parents, his role(s) in the military, his leadership skills, and actions as president have all been topics of discussion at one point or another throughout American history. He has been noted a hero and at times been depicted as a villain of sorts. So, who was George Washington? Why was, and is he still, so significant in history? and more importantly, why should he be a topic of discussion in our children's' schools?

George Washington was not only a key player in the French and Indian War and American Revolutionary War (or War for Independence), but he went on to become the first

president of the United States of America. There is a lot of speculation about Washington's life as a child and teenager, but there are not a lot of historical documents to prove that any of the events actually occurred (Ellis, 2004). A common misrepresentation of George Washington's childhood is that he chopped down a cherry tree and then confessed to his father stating that he "could not tell a lie" (Roche, 1999, p. 59). This event did not actually occur but was used to give George Washington the appearance of a truthful man (Roche, 1999). It was also speculated by some historians that Washington had a difficult childhood with strict parents, however this may or may not be factual (Ellis, 2004). What is known is that all records of George Washington's father ceased to exist after Washington was ten years old, and that although his mother was alive when he was elected president, Washington and she were not close (Ellis, 2004). George Washington also had an older, half brother, Lawrence who he looked up to during his childhood and who helped guide Washington's decision to enter the military (Ellis, 2004). Another driving factor in Washington's decision to joining the military was that he had very little education and was unable to attend college. It is estimated that George Washington received no more than a grade-school education in his life (Ellis, 2004).

Although not much is known about Washington's life as a child or as a teenager, major history books began to recognize him around the age of twenty-one (Ellis, 2004). He began his early life in the military as a civil messenger who was sent to deliver a message about the Ohio country to the French (Ellis, 2004). During this time, he encountered and made peace with Native American tribes, found enemies in others, and faced treacherous land and weather (Ellis, 2004). This was just the beginning of a long career in the military and leadership for future General and President George Washington. As his career in the military progressed, Washington fought valiantly in the French and Indian war, and then began to recognize the future United

States of America's need for Independence. During the War for Independence, Washington lead troops to fight and win multiple battles, including the final battle at Yorktown. He cared deeply for his men and pushed for them to receive proper treatment and pay from his superiors (Roche, 1999). Although Washington was military man by career and has been considered a war hero by many, he never liked the idea of war and later in his presidency developed foreign policy on neutrality (Roche, 1999).

George Washington has been coined the "indispensable man" and it is suggested that without him, our country wouldn't be the country it is today (Roche, 1999, p. 80). President George Washington was, and is historically significant for a number of reasons. Washington, with the assistance of the other founding fathers, helped to shape the United States of America we know today (Tasler, 2014). In essence, "they placed the burden of shaping the new executive branch of government squarely on the shoulders of one man, George Washington" (Cook & Klay, 2015, p.76). Creating an entirely new government was by no means a simple task. Millikan (2017) stated that "Washington faced unprecedented challenges as he created the presidency and oversaw the resolution of foreign and domestic issues" (p. 368). Along with building an entirely government and creating the presidency, Washington also played crucial roles in determining the future Federal City (Washington D.C.) (Millikan, 2017). Through all of this, Washington was depicted as a selfless, but reluctant leader- he was driven not by power, but by duty (Hutchins, 2011). Between Washington's role in leading the United States of America to freedom from Great Britain, to building a new nation, there is no question about Washington's historical significance. These events show why Washington is being discussed in schools across the nation, but what are the students learning?



George Washington is one of the most widely discussed topics in social studies classrooms across the United States of America. Mention of Washington is far more common in history texts than even that of President Abraham Lincoln. According to a textbook study by Hutchins that analyzed text books from 1982-2003, Washington was the most discussed historical figure in history text books and the number of mentions only continues to grow. "Washington appears 4.8 times on average per book in 1982, 12.8 times in 1997 and 17.7 times in 2003" (Hutchins, 2011, p. 652). While George Washington is often mentioned, the information is not always accurate. Textbooks have portrayed Washington as a hero, referred to him as 'the beloved George Washington,' and as a courageous leader (Hutchins, 2011). Unfortunately, among all of the facts and glorification that revolve around George Washington's life, many misrepresentations and misconceptions exist. Students' often hear myths about George Washington's wooden teeth, him chopping down a cherry tree, and how he treated all people equally. When in reality, President Washington's dentures were not made of wood, he never chopped down a cherry tree and he, himself, was a slave owner (Ellis, 2004).

Textbooks regarding George Washington, our first president, have been analyzed by a multitude of researchers. Representations, rather misrepresentations, depicting George Washington in textbooks have been discovered (Hutchins, 2011). Trade books about Washington, however, have not been analyzed for misrepresentations. Educators all over the USA are using trade books more frequently as supplemental materials in their classrooms. A historical topic as significant and widely discussed as our first president, George Washington, should be analyzed for misrepresentations via trade books.

## **Conclusion**

George Washington played a crucial role in the history of the United States of America and his actions say more than his words. It is important that students learn, and can grasp important concepts regarding George Washington that are presented in their social studies classes. The common core state standards heavily focus on and highly recommend that at least half (50%) of all texts used be nonfiction (Bickford & Badal, 2016). After taking into consideration the different nonfiction text-based curricular resources and the historical significance of George Washington, it is safe to address the need for George Washington centered trade books in the elementary social studies curriculum. Recognizing the frequency of misrepresentations in trade books and the significance of the prior, an analysis that compares Primary and Intermediate Elementary Trade Books' Historical Representation of George Washington is justifiable. By completing this research using well-represented biographies on Washington's life, educators will have a better idea of what resources to use that accurately depict the life and actions of George Washington, free of misrepresentations, in their grade levels.

### **Methods**

In order to analyze my selected trade books in great depth, I used a mixed methodology of both qualitative and quantitative analysis (Krippendorff, 2013). To determine my data sample, I used 32 trade books focused on George Washington, found in Appendix A. Half (16) of the trade books were geared towards primary elementary grades and half (16) of trade books targeted the intermediate elementary grades. The data sample used for this research was inclusive of the vast majority of the data pool. I wanted to have a balanced number, no less than 15, to represent each grade range for cross comparison purposes. The different trade books were placed in the different grade ranges based on their Lexile and Guided Reading levels, found on

Novelist and Booksource. The grade-levels used align with the common core state standards (CCSS) and the literacy components that are represented within. The books used for analysis were mostly nonfiction, with the exception of six books that were fiction. I wanted an equal sample to represent both grade levels where the fiction books were concerned. Three fiction books were chosen at the primary level, and another three chosen to represent the intermediate level books.

To ensure the precision of my findings, I first read each book while creating a spreadsheet to evaluate the multiple content analysis protocol questions. During this open coding stage of my content analysis, I looked for common themes that existed within the trade books. These themes were analyzed using the content analysis questions found in Appendix B. I recorded each time a question was addressed within the text, as well as when a question was mentioned, but not directly addressed. I also looked at the author of the text, the year of publication, and the grade level that the text is written for.

After reviewing the data found using open coding, I analyzed what changes needed to take place in order to establish questions that will yield quantifiable data. The content analysis protocol questions were modified, and some added during the axial coding stage, in order to make the data more inclusive. The final content analysis protocol questions can be seen in Appendix C. During this axial coding stage, I analyzed not only how often the content analysis questions were addressed within the text, but made specific examples of how (and when) they are addressed in each trade book. I noted when specific questions were addressed and to what extent they were described within the text, noting whether the information was explicit and detailed, minimized, vague or implicit, or omitted from the text. I also noted specific features

within the text that address, George Washington's childhood, his active role in the American Revolution, his passive presidency, Washington being a slave owner, and so on.

### Findings

The following section is based on clear and present patterns, I'm reporting findings that are relevant to teachers and researchers. This section notes important findings and demonstrable patterns seen throughout the texts. One noteworthy pattern was the absence of religion. Out of the total data pool ( $n = 32$ ) trade books, only one book made mention of religion within the life of George Washington. The results from the findings and other notable patterns can be found below.

As part of the content analysis protocol, the first number of questions were questions that focused on the structure of the text. Through these questions, the books genre and format were analyzed, along with the main character represented in each text. Table 1, entitled Text Structure, shows the results found when comparing these text features included in both the primary and intermediate grades level books.

Table 1

#### *Text Structure*

<u>Genre</u>	<u>Primary (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>	<u>Intermediate (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>
Historical Fiction	3(19)	3(19)
Narrative Nonfiction	2(12)	2(12)
Expository Nonfiction	4(25)	4(25)
Biography Nonfiction	7(44)	7(44)
<u>Format</u>		
Picture Book	14(88)	9(56)
Graphic Novel	1(6)	1(6)
Chapter Book	1(6)	6(38)
<u>Main Character</u>		
George Washington	11(69)	12(75)
Not George Washington	5(31)	4(25)



*Note.* Data are shown as number (percentage).

Table 1 represents the findings in relation to the Text Structures of the book(s). The text structure consists of the texts format, genre and main character within the text. The representative sample ( $n = 32$ ) consisted of books from the primary grades ( $n = 16$ ), and books from the intermediate grades ( $n = 16$ ). When considering the books genre, four main options were considered, historical fiction, narrative nonfiction, expository nonfiction, and biography nonfiction. The sample from the primary grade and the sample from the intermediate grade levels yielded the same results. Both grade levels had historical fiction ( $n = 3$ ; 19%), narrative nonfiction ( $n = 2$ ; 12%), expository nonfiction ( $n = 4$ ; 25%), and biography nonfiction ( $n = 7$ ; 44%). Of the books represented in the sample for both primary and intermediate grade levels, the findings related to the text genre came out identical. It was noted that the information was consistent across both grade levels within the representative sample ( $n = 32$ ). The formats of the books between the two grade levels varied more so than the genre. When considering the primary grade level books, the majority were formatted as picture books ( $n = 14$ ; 88%). The intermediate grade level books were more diverse in that picture books only represented roughly 56% of the intermediate data pool ( $n = 9$ ; 56%). There were more chapter books represented in the intermediate category ( $n = 6$ ; 38%) than in the primary category ( $n = 1$ ; 6%). Only one book from each grade level was formatted as a graphic novel ( $n = 1$ ; 6%).

Once the text structure(s) had been taken into consideration, the data representing common myths were analyzed. There are many myths surrounding the life of George Washington common in public consciousness. Two of the most common myths or stories told regarding George Washington are the myths involving Washington chopping down a cherry tree

and George Washington's supposedly wooden teeth. The representative sample ( $n = 32$ ) was analyzed and the findings are presented below in Table 2, entitled Myths.

Table 2

*Myths*

<u>Cherry Tree</u>	<u>Primary (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>	<u>Intermediate (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>
Explicit and Detailed- He did	1(6)	0(0)
Explicit and Detailed- He didn't	2(13)	6(38)
Minimized/ Vague	0(0)	1(6)
Omitted	13(81)	8(56)
 <u>Wooden Teeth</u>		
Explicit and Detailed- Wood Teeth	0(0)	0(0)
Explicit and Detailed- Animal Teeth	1(6)	1(6)
Explicit and Detailed- Slave Teeth	0(0)	2(13)
Explicit and Detailed- Ivory Teeth	4(25)	6(37)
Minimize/ Vague	0(0)	0(0)
Omitted	11(69)	7(44)

*Note.* Data are shown as number (percentage).

The data represented in Table 2, *Myths*, depicts the two common myths surrounding George Washington and how they were represented in the sample of ( $n = 32$ ) trade books. The table is separated to show the differences of representation in the Primary ( $n = 16$ ) and Intermediate ( $n = 16$ ) trade books. When looking at how the Cherry Tree myth was addressed in the representative sample, the findings show that Intermediate level books included discussion of the myth more frequently than the Primary level trade books. According to the findings, of the ( $n = 16$ ) Primary books the cherry tree myth was omitted in ( $n = 13$ ; 81%) of them. Only ( $n = 2$ ; 13%) of the primary books discussed the Cherry Tree myth and stated that Washington did not chop down a cherry tree, while ( $n = 1$ ; 6%) of the books presented the claim that Washington did chop down a Cherry Tree. The second myth analyzed in the text and represented in Table 2, involved Washington having wooden teeth. Similar to the Cherry Tree Myth, the Intermediate

level books included more information on Washington's teeth than the primary level books.

None of the books in the representative sample ( $n = 32$ ), claimed the myth to be true- showing that ( $n = 0$ ; 0%) of all trade books considered described Washington as having wooden teeth. In the sample of primary books ( $n = 11$ ; 69%) omitted any discussion of Washington's teeth. Of the books that did reference Washington's teeth, ( $n = 1$ ; 6%) concluded that Washington had animal teeth, ( $n = 0$ ; 0%) discussed Washington having slave teeth, and ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) implied that Washington's teeth were made of ivory. Compared to the primary level books, the intermediate level books provided more information regarding Washington's teeth as a whole ( $n = 16$ ). Of the 16 books representing the intermediate level, only ( $n = 7$ ; 44%) omitted all discussion on Washington's teeth. Of the nine remaining books that did discuss Washington's teeth, ( $n = 1$ ; 6%) described Washington as having animal teeth, ( $n = 2$ ; 13%) mentioned Washington having slave teeth, and ( $n = 6$ ; 37%) discussed Washington having teeth made of ivory.

Before becoming a war hero and the first president, George Washington had a surprisingly normal life. Table 3, entitled Lifestyle, shows how primary and intermediate trade books represent the life of George Washington before he became a well-known man. Table 3, Lifestyle, includes information about George Washington's childhood, his young adult life, his marriage/family life and his slave ownership and how they were depicted in the different leveled trade books.

Table 3

<i>Lifestyle</i>	<u>Primary (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>	<u>Intermediate (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>
<u>Childhood</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	7(44)	8(50)
Minimized/ Vague	4(25)	4(25)
Omitted	5(31)	4(25)

<u>Young Adult</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	6(37.5)	9(56)
Minimized/ Vague	4(25)	3(19)
Omitted	6(37.5)	4(25)
<u>Marriage/ Family Life</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	3(19)	4(25)
Minimized/ Vague	7(44)	10(63)
Omitted	6(37)	2(12)
<u>Slavery</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	1(6)	5(31)
Minimized/ Vague	3(19)	2(12)
Omitted	12(75)	9(56)
<i>Note.</i> Data are shown as number (percentage).		

Table 3, Lifestyle, shows some distinct patterns of representation amongst the findings. The findings regarding George Washington's childhood and the representation thereof in trade books were remarkably similar between the primary and intermediate level books. When looking at the primary level books ( $n = 16$ ), ( $n = 7$ ; 44%) of the books included information on Washington's childhood explicitly, ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) minimized the information relevant to Washington's childhood, and ( $n = 5$ ; 31%) omitted any discussion of Washington's childhood. Similarly, when looking at the findings presented through the intermediate level books ( $n = 16$ ), ( $n = 8$ ; 50%) of the books explicitly detailed events from Washington's childhood, ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) minimized information about Washington's childhood, and ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) once again omitted any discussion of Washington's childhood. George Washington's young adult life was more consistently discussed in the intermediate level books. In the primary level trade books ( $n = 16$ ), ( $n = 6$ ; 37.5%) explicitly detailed events from Washington's young adult life, ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) minimized this information, and ( $n = 6$ ; 37.5%) omitted this information entirely. In comparison, the intermediate level books ( $n = 16$ ), showed ( $n = 9$ ; 56%) of the books to explicitly detail the events from Washington's young adult life, ( $n = 3$ ; 19%) minimized

information regarding his young adult life, and only ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) omitted discussion about his young adult life. More staggering yet, were the findings regarding Washington's marriage/family life and those regarding slavery. When considering Washington's marriage/family life and slavery, the intermediate books were once again more consistent when considering the representation. Looking specifically at how Washington's marriage and family life were represented in the trade books, the primary level books ( $n = 16$ ) showed ( $n = 3$ ; 19%) of the books to have explicitly detailed this aspect of Washington's life, ( $n = 7$ ; 44%) mentioned or minimized Washington's marriage or family life, and ( $n = 6$ ; 37%) of the books omitted information about Washington's marriage and family life. In comparison, ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) of the intermediate trade books ( $n = 16$ ) showed explicit detail when talking about Washington's marriage and family life, ( $n = 10$ ; 63%) minimized this information and only ( $n = 2$ ; 12%) of the intermediate trade books omitted this information. When looking at how George Washington was represented as a slave owner, the primary level books ( $n = 16$ ) omitted this information more often than not, with ( $n = 12$ ; 75%) of the books omitting any discussion or notion that Washington owned slaves, ( $n = 3$ ; 19%) vaguely mentioned this, and only ( $n = 1$ ; 6%) included information in detail about Washington owning slaves. The intermediate level books appeared more inclusive showing that out of the ( $n = 16$ ) intermediate level trade books only ( $n = 9$ ; 56%) omitted discussion of Washington owning slaves, ( $n = 2$ ; 12%) vaguely mentioned this and ( $n = 5$ ; 31%) explicitly detailed within the text information regarding Washington and his slave ownership.

One aspect of George Washington's life that is familiar to those around the world is that of his involvement in the military. Table 4, entitled Representation in War, reports findings presented within the trade books regarding Washington's involvement in the military. The



French and Indian War, the Revolutionary War and his involvement during the war are all represented in Table 4. The table also shows how these events were represented in both primary and intermediate level trade books from the representative sample ( $n = 32$ ).

Table 4

<i>Representation in War</i>		
<u>French and Indian War</u>	<u>Primary (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>	<u>Intermediate (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>
Explicit and Detailed	3(19)	8(50)
Minimized/ Vague	5(31)	3(19)
Omitted	8(50)	5(31)
<u>American Revolution (AR)</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	7(44)	13(81)
Minimized/ Vague	8(50)	3(19)
Omitted	1(6)	0(0)
<u>Leadership- AR</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	9(56)	11(69)
Minimized/ Vague	5(31)	4(25)
Omitted	2(12)	1(6)
<u>Failure- AR</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	4(25)	8(50)
Minimized/ Vague	3(19)	6(37)
Omitted	9(56)	2(13)
<u>Success- AR</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	7(44)	11(69)
Minimized/ Vague	6(37)	4(25)
Omitted	3(19)	1(6)

*Note.* Data are shown as number (percentage).

When looking at Table 4, Representation in War, and how Washington was represented in the wars, the Intermediate level trade books ( $n = 16$ ) more consistently discuss Washington's involvement and details of the involvement. The primary level books ( $n = 16$ ) only detailed Washington's involvement in the French and Indian War in ( $n = 3$ ; 19%) of the books, the information was minimized in ( $n = 5$ ; 31%) of the books, and omitted from ( $n = 8$ ; 50%) of the

primary level trade books. The intermediate level books ( $n = 16$ ) explicitly detailed Washington's involvement in the French and Indian War in ( $n = 8$ ; 50%) of the books, minimized or vaguely stated the information on ( $n = 3$ ; 19%) of the books, and omitted discussion of Washington's involvement in ( $n = 5$ ; 31%) of the books. The American Revolution was talked about more in both categories of books. The Primary level books ( $n = 16$ ) talked about Washington's involvement in the war explicitly in ( $n = 7$ ; 44%) of the books, vaguely discussed involvement in ( $n = 8$ ; 50%) of the books and only omitted involvement in ( $n = 1$ ; 6%) of the trade books. The Intermediate level books ( $n = 16$ ) explicitly detailed Washington's involvement in the American Revolution in ( $n = 13$ ; 81%) of the books, minimized or vaguely represented involvement in ( $n = 3$ ; 19%) of the books, and did not omit information in any of the books. How Washington's role was portrayed in the American Revolution was more complex between the primary and intermediate trade books. In the primary level books, Washington was explicitly portrayed as a leader in the war in ( $n = 9$ ; 56%) of the books, his leadership was minimized in ( $n = 5$ ; 31%) of the books, and omitted in ( $n = 2$ ; 12%) of the primary books. The intermediate level books explicitly detailed Washington to be a leader in ( $n = 11$ ; 69%) of the books, minimized his leadership in ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) of the books, and omitted discussion of his leadership in ( $n = 2$ ; 13%) of the books. Another area of the American Revolution analyzed within Table 4 was how the trade books portrayed the losses Washington suffered during the War. The primary books ( $n = 16$ ) explicitly detailed the losses Washington suffered in ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) of the books, minimized information related the losses in ( $n = 3$ ; 19%) of the books, and omitted the struggles/ losses suffered in ( $n = 9$ ; 56%) of the books. In the Intermediate level book ( $n = 16$ ), the failures during the American Revolution were talked about in ( $n = 8$ ; 50%) of the books, minimized in ( $n = 6$ ; 37%) of the books, and omitted in ( $n = 2$ ;

13%) of the books. From the opposing view, Washington's success in the American Revolution was discussed in ( $n = 7$ ; 44%) of the primary level books, minimized in ( $n = 6$ ; 37%) of the books and only omitted from three (19%) of the books. The intermediate level books ( $n = 16$ ) explicitly discuss Washington's success in the American Revolution in ( $n = 11$ ; 69%) of the books, minimize the success in four (25%) of the books and omit discussion of the success in only ( $n = 1$ ; 6%) of the books.

Most well-known for his Presidency, George Washington and the events surrounding his presidency were considered within the content analysis protocol questions. Notions about Washington's leadership and role as a president were represented through many of the trade books. Table 5, entitled Presidency, represents data gathered regarding Washington's early presidency, his presidential leadership, the new democracy and his life after the presidency.

Table 5

<i>Presidency</i>		
<u>Early Days</u>	<u>Primary (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>	<u>Intermediate (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>
Explicit and Detailed	1(6)	2(12)
Minimized/ Vague	9(56)	8(50)
Omitted	6(38)	6(38)
 <u>Presidential Leadership</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	4(25)	2(12)
Minimized/ Vague	7(44)	7(44)
Omitted	5(31)	7(44)
 <u>New Democracy</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	0(0)	2(12)
Minimized/ Vague	4(25)	4(25)
Omitted	12(75)	10(63)
 <u>Post-Presidency</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	2(12)	7(44)
Minimized/ Vague	5(32)	4(25)
Omitted	9(56)	5(31)



*Note.* Data are shown as number (percentage).

George Washington's presidency was scarcely mentioned in many of the trade books across all grade levels. The primary elementary books ( $n = 16$ ) discussed the early days of Washington's presidency explicitly in only ( $n = 1$ ; 6%) of the trade books, the early days were vaguely mentioned in ( $n = 9$ ; 56%) of the trade books, and omitted completely in ( $n = 6$ ; 38%) of the primary trade books. The intermediate level books ( $n = 16$ ) explicitly mentioned the early days of the presidency in ( $n = 2$ ; 12%) of the trade books, vaguely discussed this in ( $n = 8$ ; 50%) of the trade books, and omitted information in six ( $n = 6$ ; 38%) of the intermediate level trade books. Washington's leadership during his presidency was explicitly detailed in ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) of the primary elementary trade books ( $n = 16$ ), minimized in ( $n = 7$ ; 44%) of the books, and omitted in ( $n = 5$ ; 31%) of the books for this grade level. The Intermediate level trade books ( $n = 16$ ) only explicitly detailed Washington's leadership in ( $n = 2$ ; 12%) of the books, minimized his leadership in ( $n = 7$ ; 44%), and omitted any discussion of his presidential leadership in ( $n = 7$ ; 44%) of the books. The New Democracy Washington worked to establish during his presidency was also considered in Table 5, Presidency. The primary elementary books did not explicitly discuss the new democracy in any of the books. However, the new democracy was minimized in ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) of the primary books and omitted from ( $n = 12$ ; 75%) of the books. The intermediate level books explicitly discussed the new democracy in ( $n = 2$ ; 12%) of the ( $n = 16$ ) books, minimized the information in ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) of the books and omitted the new democracy completely from ( $n = 10$ ; 63%) of the book. The last area of Washington's Presidency that Table 5 took into consideration was Washington's life after the presidency. The primary books did not discuss Washington's life after the presidency as frequently as the intermediate level books did. Of the ( $n = 16$ ) primary level books, only ( $n = 2$ ; 12%) explicitly detailed Washington's life after

the presidency, ( $n = 5$ ; 32%) of the books minimized this information and ( $n = 9$ ; 56%) of the primary books omitted any discussion of life after the presidency. The intermediate books, on the other hand, explicitly detailed Washington's life after the presidency in ( $n = 7$ ; 44%) of the books, minimized his life post-presidency in ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) of the books, and omitted discussion on post-presidency in only ( $n = 5$ ; 31%) of the trade books at this level.

The heroism surrounding George Washington has been a controversial issue for decades. The final questions in the content analysis protocol looked at whether or not Washington was depicted as a hero within these primary and intermediate elementary trade books. Table 6, entitled Heroism, shows how Washington was represented as a hero within the trade books and whether representation was denoted (stated explicitly) or connoted (insinuated) within the text.

Table 6

*Heroism*

<u>Denotes Heroism</u>	<u>Primary (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>	<u>Intermediate (<math>n = 16</math>)</u>
Explicit and Detailed	4(25)	8(50)
Minimized/ Vague	0(0)	0(0)
Omitted	12(75)	8(50)
<u>Connotes Heroism</u>		
Explicit and Detailed	4(25)	6(37.5)
Minimized/ Vague	8(50)	6(37.5)
Omitted	4(25)	4(25)

*Note.* Data are shown as number (percentage).

Heroism is interestingly depicted more often in the intermediate elementary trade books than it is in the primary elementary trade books. Heroism is denoted explicitly in ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) of the primary elementary books and denoted explicitly in ( $n = 8$ ; 50%) of the intermediate elementary books. The denotation is not minimized in any of the primary or intermediate trade books, and is omitted from ( $n = 12$ ; 75%) of the primary books and ( $n = 8$ ; 50%) of the intermediate level books. The connotation of heroism is also seen more in the intermediate level

books than the primary. The primary level books connote heroism explicitly in ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) of the books, minimizes it in ( $n = 8$ ; 50%) of the books, and omits it from ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) of the primary books. In the intermediate level books heroism is connoted explicitly in ( $n = 6$ ; 37.5%) of the books, minimized in ( $n = 6$ ; 37.5%) and omitted from ( $n = 4$ ; 25%) of these books.

When considering the findings as a whole, there are some very stark patterns. The intermediate books ( $n = 16$ ) tend to be more inclusive and detail events from Washington's life more explicitly than the primary books ( $n = 16$ ). The intermediate level books also include more information on many of the controversial issues surrounding Washington- like his marriage, slavery, and his losses in the early days of the American Revolution. The primary books, on the other hand, tend to minimize or omit information that may be too controversial or detailed for the readers at the primary level. Slavery, for example, was omitted in ( $n = 12$ ; 75%) of the primary level books. Following slavery, another trend in the Primary books is the inclusion of the positive aspect of Washington's life while omitting many of the negative aspects. The findings are representative of the total sample of trade books ( $n = 32$ ) and separated to compare the representation of events in the primary elementary trade books ( $n = 16$ ) versus the intermediate level trade books ( $n = 16$ ).

### **Discussion**

The findings of this study yielded purposeful results for both researchers and teachers. The results from the findings can help researchers see definite patterns in historical representation relevant to George Washington and help them to explore further research. Teachers can build curriculums and use the findings to select appropriate well-represented texts for their classroom. The findings were not intended to criticize or demean any particular author,

but to discover and juxtapose the historical representation between the primary and intermediate level books.

### **Implications for Researchers**

There are many reasons why this study is relevant to researchers. This is one of few studies where a Presidents historical representation in trade books has been looked at. There are a few other studies where Presidential trade books have been analyzed to discover misrepresentations, but this is the only study where George Washington, specifically, was analyzed. Many other studies have been done in the past regarding the historical representation of people and events. For example, Andrew Jackson's representation in Trade Books has been researched (Sakowicz, 2016), but many other presidents like Thomas Jefferson, Abraham Lincoln and Theodore Roosevelt have yet to be investigated. With this in mind it is important to point out that Washington is the first of the presidents on Mount Rushmore to be researched in this way. Within this study, common patterns and findings appeared, similar to those found in the prior studies.

Omission, a historical misrepresentation, appeared within this study as it has in numerous other studies (Sakowicz, 2016; Bickford & Lindsay, 2017). The appearance of omission appeared most prominent with areas like slavery and religion. Slavery, as reported above, was omitted from most of the trade books used in the data sample. This means that most trade books used omitted any mention of Washington owning slaves, or slavery in general. The vast amount of violence and death that often surround slavery could be a potential reason many children's trade books avoid any discussion of slavery to begin with (Bickford & Rich, 2014). This includes the books written about important and often glorified historical figures who lived during and often participated in slavery. Religion was also omitted from nearly all of the trade books

used for this study, only one of the total ( $n = 32$ ) trade books used made mention of religion and only vaguely within the text. Other studies have shown similar patterns of omission of religion in children's literature (Sakowicz, 2016; Bickford & Lindsay, 2017).

Another important finding to note is the pattern in which heroification and omission were seen more commonly in the primary level trade books. The primary trade books showed a more distinct pattern of omission with areas like slavery, war, and other hardships. Yet, the use of heroification in primary grade was much greater than in the intermediate grades. Similar patterns of heroification and omissions were also present in other studies (Bickford & Rich, 2014). Another similarity was the noted spiraling of increasingly complex topics between primary and intermediate books (Bickford, 2018; Bickford & Lindsay, 2017), which is expected and needed if a topic is going to be repeated.

### **Implications for Teachers**

Social Studies is often an area of curriculum that is set aside in today's classrooms. With a heavy emphasis on common core, many teachers find it difficult to incorporate the social studies curriculum into their daily, or even weekly, classroom routine. It can also be easy for teachers to teach social studies word-for-word right out of the text book. This study shows teachers the importance of social studies and historical thinking in the classroom, introduces teachers to new ways to incorporate history into their reading and writing curriculum, alerts teachers to misconceptions and myths common in public consciousness that appear in trade books, and makes teachers aware of the patterns present within. Most importantly, this research informs teachers of ways that these trade books and the information within can be used in their classroom to promote historical literacy and thinking.



The twin Twin-Text approach is a common and well researched approach that teachers can use in the classroom to promote historical literacy (Furtado & Johnson, 2010). The twin-text approach involves combining a fiction trade book with a non-fiction trade book to promote a deeper level of understanding and comprehension amongst students (Frye, Trathen, & Wilson, 2009). When completing a twin-text approach, a teacher should stimulate students' thinking by providing students with a way to compare the two texts (e.g. Venn Diagram). Some texts from the data pool for this study that may pair well for the twin-text approach would be *Revolutionary War on Wednesday* by Mary Pope Osborn (fiction) and *The American Revolution* by Christi E. Parker (nonfiction). *The American Revolution* (Parker, 2005) may also pair well with *George Washington's Socks* by Elvira Woodruff (fiction) or *George Washington's Spy*, also by Woodruff (fiction). This example of books would be good for looking at how a fictional book compares to a nonfiction book discussing the American Revolution and George Washington's role. Using this approach will allow students to decipher between historical accuracy and events made up to support a story line. This approach also helps teachers to align their lessons with the common core state standards reading informational texts and reading literature standards (CCSS, 2010).

When considering a social studies curriculum, teachers should also be aware of the many gaps that exist. Previous research has shown that using only text books in a classroom can lead to many misconceptions and leave out important historical detail (Moss, 1992). Likewise, although more inclusive, trade books can also lead students to misconceptions or leave them with questions, wanting to know more about a topic. So how can teachers fill these gaps? Supplementing social studies lessons and connecting trade books with primary sources is a good way to facilitate historical thinking. A relatable example to George Washington would be the

Constitution. Students might like to look at the original declaration, and 18<sup>th</sup> century pros and syntax, this allows students to try to translate cursive and old English. There are also many websites that provide teachers with primary sources and document based questions (DBQ's) to assist social studies- related topics. *Lessons & Document Based Questions* (Lessons & Document Based Questions, 2012) is a website that provides teachers with DBQs specific to historical events. In relation to George Washington, this website provides a plethora of DBQ's regarding Independence and the American Revolution.

Teachers can also make variations to learning within the classroom by using trade books to conduct literature circles. Using literature circles to promote reading informational texts in a classroom is a good way for teachers to modify lessons and provide reading instruction at multiple levels (Barone & Barone, 2016). Literature circles help engage students in reading and promote student lead discussion within peer groups of equal ability and interest levels. When conducting a literature circle, the teacher will often give the students summaries of a few books and allow them to pick their top choices, at this point students are separated into groups by the teacher based on interest and ability levels (DeVault, 2009). Teachers could potentially use any of the books listed in Appendix A to conduct literature circles at the primary and intermediate grade levels. This practice would allow students to feel in control of their learning and also help students stay engaged while reading about George Washington and his role in history. Students can actively participate in group conversation, discuss historical events and people, and acquire a new sense of historical knowledge while participating in these role-based groups.

This research allows teachers to better understand how history and social studies can be incorporated into the daily lives of their students. It provides multiple examples on how teachers

can incorporate these history-focused trade books into the classroom and more importantly shares why teachers need to incorporate history into their daily curriculum.

### **Limitations**

As present in many research studies, this study has limitations. First, all trade books involved were only read and analyzed by one reviewer. The content analysis protocol questions were also completed and analyzed by only one reviewer. Second, the data pool was meant to be representative of all of the George Washington trade books intended for primary and intermediate grade levels but it is possible that some, or many, were overlooked. Lastly, accurate representations and decisive conclusions cannot be made from this single study alone.

### **Areas for Future Study**

Further areas of study in relation to this study may include but are not limited to the following. Research on George Washington and the historical representation in middle level and secondary trade books, text books and other curricular resources. Researchers may also benefit by using this study to address the historical representation of the American Revolution in children's literature, along with other prominent historical figures involved in the American Revolutionary War. It may also be of interest to those who wish to research the other Presidents sculpted on Mount Rushmore including: Abraham Lincoln, Thomas Jefferson, and Theodore Roosevelt.

### **References**



- Barone, D., & Barone, R. (2016). "Really," "not possible," "I can't believe it": exploring informational texts in literature circles. *The Reading Teacher*, 70(1).
- Bean, R. M., Zigmond, N., & Hartman, D. K. (1994). Adapted use of social studies textbooks in elementary classrooms: Views of classroom teachers. *Remedial and Special Education*, 15(4), 216-226.
- Bickford III, J. H., & Schuette, L. N. (2016). Trade books' historical representation of the black freedom movement, Slavery through Civil Rights. *Journal of Children's Literature*, 42(1), 20-43.
- Bickford, J. (2013). Examining historical (mis)representations of Christopher Columbus within children's literature. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 8(2), 1-24.
- Bickford III, J. H. (2018). Examining LGBTQ-Based Literature Intended for Primary and Intermediate Elementary Students. *The Elementary School Journal*, 118(3), 000-000.
- Bickford, J. H., & Silva, K. A. (2016). Trade books' historical representation of Anne Sullivan Macy, the miracle worker. *Social Studies Research & Practice*, 11(1), 56-72.
- Bickford, J. H., Dilley, D., & Metz, V. (2015). Historical writing, speaking, and listening using informational texts in elementary curricula. *The Councilor: A Journal of the Social Studies*, 76(1), 1-16.
- Bickford, J. H., & Lindsay, M. (2017). Franklin Delano Roosevelt's historical representation within children's and young adult literature. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 12(2), 125-138.
- Bickford, J., & Badal, T. (2017). Trade books' historical representation of Eleanor Roosevelt. *First Lady of the World. Social Studies Research and Practice*, 11(3), 1-18.

- Bickford III, J. H., & Rich, C. W. (2014). Examining the representation of slavery within children's literature. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 66.
- Camp, D. (2000). It takes two: Teaching with twin texts of fact and fiction. *The Reading Teacher*, 53(5), 400-408.
- Chernow, R. (2011) *Washington: A life*. London: Penguin Books
- Common Core State Standards Initiative. (2010). *Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts & Literacy In History/Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects*.
- Cook, S. A., & Klay, W. E. (2015). George Washington's precedents: The institutional legacy of the American republic's founding public administrator. *Administration & Society*, 47(1), 75-95.
- DeVault, N. (2009). *Literature circles in library class*. Library Media Connection, 28(1).
- Ellis, J. J. (2004). *His excellency: George Washington*. New York, NY: Vintage Books, a division of Random House, Inc.
- Forest, D. E. (2016). What educators need to do with biased children's books on religion, gender and race. *Journal of International Social Studies*, 6(1), pp. 74-83.
- Frye, E. M., Trathen, W., & Wilson, K. (2009). A Twin-Text Unit of Study. *Social Studies and the Young Learner*, 21(3), 15-16.
- Furtado, L., & Johnson, L. (2010). Enhancing Summarization Skills Using Twin Texts: Instruction in Narrative and Expository Text Structures. *Reading Matrix: An International Online Journal*, 10(2).
- Ghiso, M. P., Campano, G., & Hall, T. (2012). Braided histories and experiences in literature for children and adolescents. *Journal of Children's Literature*, 38(2), 14-22.

- Gurung, R. A. (2017). Predicting learning: Comparing an open educational resource and standard textbooks. *Scholarship of Teaching and Learning in Psychology*, 3(3), 233-247.
- Hutchins, R. D. (2011). Heroes and the renegotiation of national identity in American history textbooks: representations of George Washington and Abraham Lincoln, 1982–2003. *Nations and Nationalism*, 17(3), 649-668.
- Jago, C., & Fink, L. (2014). First do no harm. *Voices from the Middle*, 21(3), 10.
- Krippendorff, K. (2013). Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology, Third Edition. Washington, DC: Sage Publishing.
- Lawson, C., & LaDuke-Pelster, F. (2017). CCSS collaboration: How librarians can collaborate with teachers on Common Core. *Children and Libraries*, 15(3), 14-16.
- Lessons & document based questions. (2012). Retrieved from [http://www.polk-fl.net/staff/teachers/socialstudies\\_lessons.htm](http://www.polk-fl.net/staff/teachers/socialstudies_lessons.htm).
- Matusevich, M. (2006). Strange bedfellows: Censorship and history textbooks. *Social Studies Research and Practice*, 1(3), 359-373.
- McKean, B. (2002). Artistic representations in three fifth-grade social studies textbooks. *The Elementary School Journal*, 103(2), 187-19
- Millikan, N. (2017). The historical presidency: The first president and the federal city: George Washington and the creation of Washington, DC. *Presidential Studies Quarterly*, 47(2), 365-377.
- Monte-Sano, C., De La Paz, S., & Felton, M. (2015). Teaching argument writing and “content” in diverse middle school history classrooms. *Social Education*, 79(4), 194-199.
- Morgan, H., & Forest, D. E. (2016). What educators need to do with biased children’s books on religion, gender and race. *Journal of International Social Studies*, 6(1), 74-83.

- Morris, R. V., Morgan-Fleming, B., & Janisch, C. (2001). The diary of Calvin Fletcher—using primary sources in the elementary classroom. *The Social Studies*, 92(4), 151-153.
- Moss, B. (1992). Nonfictions trade books in the elementary curriculum. *The Education Digest*, 57(8), 66-69.
- National Council for the Social Studies. (2013). *College, career, and civic life (C3) framework for social studies state standards: Guidance for enhancing the rigor of K-12 civics, economics, geography, and history*. National Council for the Social Studies.
- Roberts, S. L. (2014). A review of social studies textbook content analyses since 2002. *Social Studies Research & Practice*, 9(3), 51-65.
- Roche, G. (1999). George Washington's legacy. *USA Today*, 59-60.
- Ruswick, B. (2015). What does it mean to be an American?: Training history students and prospective teachers to see the assumptions in their textbooks. *The History Teacher*, 48(4), 667-692.
- Sakowicz, S. K. (2016). Researching the historical representations of Andrew Jackson in trade books. *Social Studies Research and Practices*, 11(2), 33-50.
- Schwebel, S. (2014). Historical fiction, the Common Core, and disciplinary habits of mind. *Social Education*, 78(1), 20-24.
- Shanahan, T. (2015). Common Core State Standards: A new role for writing. *The Elementary School Journal*, 115(4), 464-479.
- Tasler, N. (2014). Three decisions that defined George Washington's leadership legacy. *Harvard Business Review*, 2-4.
- Uecker, R., Kelly, S., & Napierala, M. (2014). Implementing the Common Core State Standards. *Knowledge Quest*, 42(3), 48-51.

Wallender, J. (2014). The Common Core State Standards in American public education:

Historical underpinnings and justifications. *Delta Kappa Gamma Bulletin*, 80(4), 7-11.

- Albee, S. (2017). *George Washington the first president* (C. Ko, Illus.). New York: HarperCollins Publishers.
- Adler, D. A. (1989). *A picture book of George Washington* (J. & A. Wallner, Illus.). New York: Holiday House, Inc.
- Bailer, D. (2017). *George Washington*. Mankato: The Child's World.
- Bednarchuk, B. (2015). *Our first president George Washington* (M. Piwowarski, Illus.). Mankato: Cantata Learning.
- Brown, D. (2007). *Dolly Madison saves George Washington* (D. Brown, Illus.). Boston: Houghton Mifflin Books.
- Calkhoven, L. (2006). *George Washington an American life*. New York: Sterling Publishing Co., Inc.
- Chandra, D. & Comora, M. (2003). *George Washington's teeth* (B. Cole, Illus.). New York: Square Fish.
- Cross Giblin, J. (1992). *George Washington a picture book biography* (M. Dooling, Illus.). New York: Scholastic Inc.
- Crosson Gilpin, C. (2014). *George Washington*. Washington, D. C.: National Geographic Society.
- Doeden, M. (2006). *George Washington leading a new nation* (C. Martin, Illus.). North Mankato: Capstone Press.
- Edison, E. (2013). *George Washington*. North Mankato: Capstone Press.
- Edwards, R. (2009). *Who was George Washington?* New York: Penguin Random House LLC.
- Fontes, J. & R. (2001). *George Washington: soldier, hero, president*. New York: DK Publishing Inc.



Fritz, J. (1969). *George Washington's breakfast* (P. Galdone, Illus.). New York: PaperStar.

Fritz, J. (1992). *George Washington's mother* (D. DiSalvo, Illus.). New York: Penguin Random House LLC.

Haldy, E. E. (2017). *George Washington* (J. Bane, Illus.). Ann Arbor: Cherry Lake Publishing.

Harness, C. (2000). *George Washington*. Washington, D. C.: National Geographic Society.

Herweck, D. (2012). *George Washington*. Huntington Beach: Teacher Created Materials, Inc.

Hort, L. (2005). *George Washington a photographic story of a life*. New York: DK Publishing Inc.

Jackson, G. (2000). *George Washington our first president* (C. Van Wright & Y. Hwa Hu, Illus.). New York: Scholastic Inc.

Keating, F. (2012). *George: George Washington, our founding father* (M. Wimmer, Illus.). New York: Simon & Schuster Children's Publishing Division.

Mara, W. (2013). *George Washington*. New York: Scholastic Inc.

Meltzer, B. (2016). *I am George Washington* (C. Eliopoulos, Illus.). New York: Penguin Random House LLC.

Norwich, G. (2012). *I am George Washington* (A. VanArsdale, Illus.). New York: Scholastic Inc.

Olesen, A. (2016). *George Washington America's history maker*. New York: The Rosen Publishing Group, Inc.

Parker, C. E. (2005). *George Washington*. Huntington Beach: Teacher Created Materials, Inc.

Parker, C. E. (2005). *The American Revolution*. Huntington Beach: Teacher Created Materials, Inc.

Pope Osborne, M. (2000). *Revolutionary War on Wednesday* (S. Murdocca, Illus.). New York: Random House Children's Books.

Roop, P. & C. (1986). *Buttons for General Washington* (P. E. Hanson, Illus.). Minneapolis: Learner Publishing Group, Inc.

Small, D. (1994). *George Washington's cows*. New York: Square Fish.

Woodruff, E. (2010). *George Washington's spy*. New York: Scholastic Inc.

Woodruff, E. (1991). *George Washington's socks*. New York: Scholastic Inc.

1. Author's Name, Publication Date, Title, Company
2. Intended grade level of the book:
  - a) Primary (K-2)
  - b) Intermediate (3-5)
3. What is the book's genre?
  - a) Fiction: Historical fiction
  - b) Non-fiction: Narrative non-fiction, expository, biography
4. Who was the main character(s)? Was there anyone besides George Washington?
5. Did the trade books include information about Washington's childhood?
6. How was Washington's young adult life depicted in the trade books?
7. Was the American Revolution discussed in the trade book?
8. How did the trade book portray Washington's role in the American Revolution?
9. Did the trade book include information about Washington's family life?
10. Does the trade book discuss Washington's early days in the presidency? How does the trade book portray these early days?
11. How do the trade books depict Washington's presidency?
12. Does the trade book portray Washington to be a 'hero'?

*Appendix C – Content Analysis Protocol Revised*

1. Author's Name, Title, Publication Date, Company

- a) Author:
  - b) Title:
  - c) Publication Date:
  - d) Company:
2. Intended grade level of the book:
- a) Primary (K-2)
  - b) Intermediate (3-5)
3. What is the book's genre?
- a) Fiction: Historical fiction
  - b) Non-fiction
    - i. Narrative non-fiction
    - ii. Expository
    - iii. Biography
4. Format
- a) Picture book
  - b) Graphic Novel
  - c) Chapter book
5. Who was the main character(s)? Was there anyone besides Washington?
6. Were common myths addressed?
- a) Teeth
    - i. (Explicit and detailed)
- Myth

1. Wooden Teeth

Historical Basis

2. Animal Teeth
3. Slave Teeth
4. Ivory Teeth

- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

1. Self-Conscious

- iii. (omitted entirely)

- b) Cherry tree

- i. (Explicit and detailed)

Myth- he did

Historical Basis- he didn't

- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

- iii. (omitted entirely)

7. Did the trade books include information about George Washington's childhood? What was included?

- i. (Explicit and detailed)

- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

- iii. (omitted entirely)

8. How was George Washington's young adult life depicted in the trade books?

- i. (Explicit and detailed)

- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

- iii. (omitted entirely)

9. Was the French Indian War discussed in the trade book?

- i. (Explicit and detailed)
- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)
- iii. (omitted entirely)

10. Was the American Revolution discussed in the trade book?

- i. (Explicit and detailed)
- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)
- iii. (omitted entirely)

11. How did the trade book portray Washington's role in the American Revolution?

a) Was he depicted as a leader?

- i. (Explicit and detailed)
- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)
- iii. (omitted entirely)

b) Did the book discuss his failure/losses early in the war?

- i. (Explicit and detailed)
- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)
- iii. (omitted entirely)

c) Did the book discuss his success later in the war?

- i. (Explicit and detailed)
- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)
- iii. (omitted entirely)

12. Did the trade book include information about George Washington's family life?



- a) Did the book discuss his marriage with Martha?
  - i. (Explicit and detailed)
  - ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)
  - iii. (omitted entirely)
- 13. Does the trade book mention Washington owning slaves? If so, how?
  - i. (Explicit and detailed)
  - ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)
  - iii. (omitted entirely)
- 14. Was the constitutional convention addressed?
  - i. (Explicit and detailed)
  - ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)
  - iii. (omitted entirely)
- a) Implications for contemporary society?
  - i. (Explicit and detailed)
  - ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)
  - iii. (omitted entirely)
- 15. Is religion included?
  - a) How is religion included?
    - i. (Explicit and detailed)
    - ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)
    - iii. (omitted entirely)
  - b) How is religion portrayed?
    - i. (Explicit and detailed)

- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

- iii. (omitted entirely)

c) What are religions implications for politics?

- i. (Explicit and detailed)

- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

- iii. (omitted entirely)

16. Does the trade book discuss Washington's early days in the presidency? How does the trade book portray these early days?

- i. (Explicit and detailed)

- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

- iii. (omitted entirely)

17. How do the trade books depict Washington's presidency?

a) Leadership

- i. (Explicit and detailed)

- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

- iii. (omitted entirely)

b) New Democracy

- i. (Explicit and detailed)

- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

- iii. (omitted entirely)

18. Does the book address Washington's life after the presidency?

- i. (Explicit and detailed)

- ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

- iii. (omitted entirely)

19. Does the trade book portray Washington to be a 'hero'?

a) Uses the word 'hero'

i. (Explicit and detailed)

ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

iii. (omitted entirely)

b) Suggests Washington fits the characteristics of 'hero' based on the following definition: "a person noted for courageous acts or nobility of character" (dictionary.com)

i. (Explicit and detailed)

ii. (Minimized, vague, or implicit)

iii. (omitted entirely)

20. Do you see historical documents?

a) none

b) a ton

c) few